

**Architectural Review Board
Regular Meeting
February 7, 2013
4:30 PM**

Members Present: Stan Henley, John Hart, Greg Mayes, and John Resig

Members Absent: Chris Clark

Others Present: Candace Dowdy, Justin Crice, Deana Wright, Joe Nanney, and Edward Marlowe.

Chairman Stan Henley called the meeting to order. Chairman Henley asked for approval of the minutes September 6, 2012 regular meeting. **John Resig made a motion to approve the minutes as submitted. John Hart seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

Chairman Henley stated that the second item on the agenda was a public hearing to review a Certificate of Appropriateness application for Joe Nanney to make exterior alterations to the dwelling at 501 Poplar Street. Candace Dowdy used a power point presentation to identify the zoning of the property, surrounding properties and photos of the house at 501 Poplar Street. Ms. Dowdy stated Mr. Nanney would like to make the following changes to the exterior of the property; replacement of several non functioning windows, replacing existing roof with a metal roof, some replacement of shingles, adding a canopy to the east side of the house, repair the fence, and painting the exterior of the home. She went on to say she would let Mr. Nanney clarify any incorrect requests or additional requests during the public hearing. Ms. Dowdy stated this property lies within a B-3 Zoning District and is also within the Historical Overlay District. Ms. Dowdy stated what the permitted uses in a B-3 zone are and that even though the house has been vacant for over one year and has lost the grandfather clause she would encourage the residential use to remain if at all possible since this is a contributing structure in the Historic Overlay District. She clarified that if Mr. Nanney wanted to use this for commercial purposes it could not go back to residential use only per the zoning ordinance. Ms. Dowdy stated that the primary use would have to be commercial and the secondary use could be residential with a conditional use permit. Ms. Dowdy did conclude that residential use in this case, if the house was restored, is the best use for the property. She added that that Board was just looking at the exterior of the home tonight to either approve or disapprove what Mr. Nanney has requested to do.

Chairman Henley opened the public hearing. Ms. Deana Wright of Murray Main Street was sworn in. Ms. Wright stated this piece of property is not on the National Register due in part because no one has bothered to apply for that designation. She stated this house is certainly eligible being old enough and does have many historical details still intact being in the Historic Overlay District and the Renaissance Area. Ms. Wright stated it was built in the 1890's. She stated the late Patricia Holton had given her information regarding the history of the home. Ms.

Wright stated that because of the architecture of the building it is one of the only houses like this in Murray. She stated the Victorian style was added to the house after original construction. Ms. Wright went on to say a metal roof would not be historically correct for this piece of property or Murray, KY unless the Board found it to be that way. Her main concern was the idea to cover windows or rotten wood on the house. She hoped Mr. Nanney would consider replacing that wood and repairing windows as a preference. She hoped the owner would take care of the property and keep the historical integrity intact because it is one of a kind in Murray, KY.

John Resig asked if the windows needed replacement, will they need to be replaced in like-kind? Ms. Wright said yes in like kind, preferably with wood windows. Greg Mayes stated that he thought the metal roof is historically correct. Ms. Wright confirmed this but not in Murray, KY. Ms. Wright said from everything she has seen, that this house did not have a metal roof on it. She added that it was important that this roof remains workable. She described the nature of the house for gatherings and parties, and that the owners added the Victorian features (stain glass and additions) to the house. Ms. Wright explained the late Ms. Holton bought the house back and started restoring the house from when it was previously separated into apartments.

Chairman Henley opened the public hearing to those in favor of the application.

Joe W. Nanney, 1435 US Highway 641 North Benton, KY 42025, was sworn in. Mr. Nanney explained his interest in the house and the specific repairs he would make to the exterior of the house. He explained the color of pink he would use repainting the exterior and his plans for replacing the windows. He then spoke on the need for a canopy on the east side of the house. He stated he needed this to restore the doors and protect them from the weather and sunlight in the morning.

Greg Mayes asked if this section of the house was an addition to it. Mr. Nanney stated it was an addition. Mr. Nanney then spoke about the roof and said it was not leaking. He stated he does not have to replace the roof but if he did it he would like to replace it with dark green 26 gauge standing seam metal roof.

John Resig asked if there was rotten wood on the west side of the house or was it just lacking paint. Mr. Nanney said it was not rotting but there are some rotten boards on the house that Murray Lumber said they could replace them with matching lumber and boards. He stated he would treat the house for termites and would have to jack up the house where it is sagging. Mr. Nanney spoke at length as to how he would heat the house with heating pumps piped to the home.

John Hart asked about the oval windows on the second floor of the house. Mr. Nanney stated many changes were made to the house and the owners added the windows to match the window downstairs. Mr. Nanney then spoke about the large window he had boarded up located in the downstairs of the house. John Hart asked about the roof that is on the building. Mr. Nanney stated it has at least two layers of shingles and maybe three layers. John Hart then asked if his plan would be to pull those shingles off. Mr. Nanney stated not unless he had to. He stated he would get the opinion of his roofer and other contractor. Greg Mayes made a comment about the windows Mr. Nanney had already bought. Mr. Nanney stated that they were a clad wood window

and would be painted cranberry on the outside and painted on the inside to match the interior. Mr. Nanney also clarified that he will only replace the windows upstairs that he had already purchased into the attic area.

John Resig asked if the deflection shown in one of the pictures was a structural problem. Mr. Nanney confirmed it was a structural problem and that the floor had dropped down about five (5) inches in that particular location. Mr. Nanney reiterated the fact that that portion of the house would need to be jacked up. Mr. Nanney stated he enjoyed doing things such as this referring to fixing up houses.

John Hart stated he was thrilled to see someone taking the house on for renovation but his concern was covering wood that was already rotting and what would happen after covering it up. Mr. Nanney said he needed to cut off the water getting to it. Mr. Nanney then said it actually should be replaced but it was a big job. Mr. Nanney asked if the Board would give him the option of what to do with the windows, but if the Board didn't want to give that option then to make it clear to him what he could do. He stated he would do what the Board required.

Greg Mayes asked if Mr. Nanney had thought about taking the windows out and having them redone. Mr. Nanney stated that would be an ordeal and stated the only thing that makes any sense would be to replace the windows with therma pane windows. Mr. Nanney stated he hoped to finish this project up by the end of August. Mr. Nanney stated he will scrap the existing paint off and then paint it white with Zeigler oil based paint. He then would paint the house with colors.

Mr. Nanney indicated he would like to have Jack Wallis look at how to better brace the stain glass window from the inside (picture shown on PowerPoint). John Resig asked if the stain glass had bowed any. Mr. Nanney indicated it had.

Chairman Henley closed the public hearing and moved to board discussion.

Chairman Henley said this project Mr. Nanney's embarked on is going to be costly and common sense repairs should be authorized by the Board. John Hart stated his main concerns were covering up wood that was already rotten and concerned with replacing the roof with a metal roof. Greg Mayes said he didn't mind a metal roof on there if it was historic. He stated that green is not a historical color so he has a concern about colors for the house. Greg Mayes went on to say the Board should have some say in the appearance of this. He questioned whether the Board had the latitude to think about the color of this. Ms. Dowdy said she didn't think color was an item the Board can mandate and Ms. Deana Wright confirmed this. John Hart stated that since the colors of a building directly affect its historical correctness such choices are within the board's purview to guide.

Mr. Nanney came back and addressed the board and stated if the Board doesn't think it should have a green roof, he would be open to ideas of what color should be on the roof. He said if the Board didn't think the color was what it was supposed to be it would be no problem for him to change the color. Greg Mayes stated a prior applicant had brought in samples for the Board to look at during their request for a Certificate of Appropriateness when making alterations. Mr.

Nanney reiterated he was open to suggestions on the color but stated he came up with green because he likes contrast. He said he would be glad to bring a color chart and put a suggested color on it. He went on to say it was no problem to change the color. Stan Henley made a comment about replacing the roof. Greg Mayes stated he thought Mr. Nanney was taking a risk and continued to say that Mr. Nanney is asking for an option to replace the roof and he thought giving him that option presented a lot of unknowns. Mr. Nanney confirmed he wanted the option to put a standing seam 26 gauge metal roof on the house, with a one foot overhang on the top that hopefully would last a long time. Mr. Nanney said the color would be one that is mutually agreed upon. Greg Mayes said with the weight of the metal, you wouldn't want to put the weight over three layers of shingles. Chairman Henley said typically in the past when a building has structural issues, the Board can make a recommendation that is not enforceable by the Board. He went on to say this would be non-binding free advice.

Ms. Dowdy stated that if the Board gave Mr. Nanney the latitude to replace the roof, he could submit a color scheme and that she could submit those options to the Board for consideration. Mr. Nanney was willing to work with the Board to do that. Greg Mayes stated he feels like the Board does have a say on colors of paint and roof in the Historic District, otherwise why does the Board exist. He stated the Board is looking to keep this house historically accurate. Mr. Nanney stated he would get other opinions before replacing this roof. He also stated the roof in his opinion would be alright with the additional weight based on the fact the roof was oak.

Ms. Dowdy said the main things the Board needed to consider was whether to replace the roof with a metal roof, replacing the windows, placing a canopy over the doors on the east side of the house, and the covering of any rotten wood panels. Mr. Nanney came back to the microphone and also requested to replace or enclose the existing garage doors on the house. He clarified that he would like to put up new garage doors or enclose them with siding to match the house.

John Hart made a motion to approve the following for the renovation proposal by Joe Nanney for the property at 501 Poplar Street;

- 1. Replacement of windows with modern windows that are visually equivalent.**
- 2. Replacement of the roof with a standing-seam roof of a color to be approved at a later date by the Architectural Review Board.**
- 3. Renovation or replacement of window sills and front porch roof beam. If rotted these items should be replaced otherwise the existing material should be encapsulated and painted.**
- 4. Replacement of the existing garage doors with new doors or the openings enclosed with siding to match the existing siding on the house.**
- 5. Extension of the porch on the east of the house and installation of a porch roof as described. The bottom concrete should be faced with brick as discussed.**
- 6. Repair of existing fence.**

It is recommended that the additional structural load of the metal roof be carefully studied before installation over the existing roofs. The combined load of the new metal roof and the existing shingle roofs may be more than the structure of the building can support.

John Resig seconded the motion. Motion carried unanimously.

Chairman Henley submitted a questionnaire for the Board to fill out from Ms. Deana Wright from Murray Main Street that had to do with Board member involvement with historic preservation.

Chairman Henley stated the next item on the agenda was Election of Officers. **John Resig made a motion to elect Stan Henley-Chairman, Chris Clark-Vice-Chairman, and John Hart-Secretary. Greg Mayes seconded and the motion carried unanimously.**

John Resig moved to adjourn. Greg Mayes seconded and the motion carried unanimously.

Chairman, Stan Henley

Recording Secretary, Candace Dowdy